

## THE ANALYSIS OF COMMUNITY SATISFACTION LEVEL AND PARTICIPATION IN DEVELOPMENT AT BONGO TUA VILLAGE

Rokiyanto Usman <sup>1)</sup>, Rizal <sup>2)</sup> Aryati Hamzah <sup>3)</sup>

<sup>1)</sup> Bina Mandiri University, Gorontalo, Indonesia.

<sup>2)</sup> Bina Mandiri University Gorontalo, Indonesia.

<sup>3)</sup> Bina Mandiri University Gorontalo, Indonesia.

E-mail : [rokiyantousman@17gmail.com](mailto:rokiyantousman@17gmail.com)

### ABSTRACT

This research aims ; 1) To determine community satisfaction towards development in Bongo Tua Village; 2) To find out community participation towards development in Bongo Tua Village.

The research method used a qualitative approach. There were 5 informants. Descriptive analysis techniques through qualitative research through data and information obtained directly from informants then analyzed by using the existing theoretical basis and explained systematically based on facts in the field.

The results showed that (1) for community satisfaction, it was considered that they did not have a form or system of suggestions and complaints, which the Bongo Tua Village Government used, because they only directly provided suggestions and complaints only through the BPD directly, there were also directly to the Bongo Tua Village Government. The form of measuring community satisfaction was by looking at the results of satisfaction surveys that were conducted periodically. It was far has been in the form of development, both physical and non-physical that supports providing community satisfaction. Even the skills and abilities in the implementation of development were considered to be lacking and there were still many people who were not enthusiastic to put attention. For public behavior in assessing the services provided by the community, it is considered not good because there were still individual attitudes in the Village Government that were not concerned with the community. (2) In terms of community participation, especially the implementation of development in Bongo Tua Village, it was considered not optimal considering that it turned out that so far participation in physical matters has been running, but participation in non-physical activities was less supportive in the implementation of development in Bongo Tua Village.

**Keywords: Satisfaction, Participation, Community and Development.**

### INTRODUCTION

As a public service, that responsible for providing the best service to the community is the government. The Republic of Indonesia as a unitary state in administering regional government. By giving a chance

and the extent to which the regions are self-governing. The implementation of regional autonomy depends on the readiness of the regional government to organize government system so that development is effective, effective, tranparant and more

accountable to get the participation of community.

State development is carried out for the welfare of community, as well as Indonesia. The 1945 Constitution states that the purpose of the national development of the Indonesian nation is to protect the entire nation and the entire homeland of Indonesia, promote public welfare, educate the nation's life and participate in carrying out world order.

The objectives of village development are as follows; firstly, to increase economic productivity in rural areas to reduce poverty levels in rural areas. Second, the welfare of the villagers for social purposes. Third, improve the quality of life of rural communities for cultural purposes. Fourth, developing and growing community participation in supporting development efforts and producing results [1].

The objectives of village development economically are; firstly, to increase the productivity of rural areas by reducing poverty. Second, social goals are directed at the distribution of welfare of the villagers. Third, cultural goals in the sense of improving the quality of life in general for rural communities. Fourth, the policy objectives are to grow and develop maximum village community participation in supporting development efforts and in utilizing and developing development outcomes.

Community satisfaction is one of the benchmarks in the implementation of development. This explains that it is not only participation that contributes but community satisfaction with development is one form of giving satisfaction to development in the region and even in the village. The phenomenon or problem that often occurs is the existence of a benchmark for community satisfaction in the implementation of development in the region and even in the village.

In this research, Bongo Tua Village, located in Paguyaman District, Boalemo Regency, became one of the priorities in the implementation of village development. Citizen satisfaction is one of the benchmarks in the implementation of development. The problems that often occurs is the existence of a benchmark for community satisfaction in the implementation of development in the region and even in the village. The benchmark for community satisfaction is seen from the success of the area or village in achieving the development targets implemented. In addition, this effort is the basis for encouraging the implementation of development as well as improvements in development indicators as well as improving the quality of services to be implemented. construction of a 95-meter concrete rebate road (LKPPD, 2019).

The complaint from one of the community leaders about cleaning the canal, so that the village government could invite all rice farmers to clean the canal, but the Headman said it had nothing to do with the Headman because he didn't own rice fields. The same thing happened during the *Eid al-Fitr* deliberation, the Headman of Bongo Tua had taken and made his own decisions in the implementation of the *Eid al-Fitr holiday*, even though it was hoped that the deliberation would be carried out together with the mosque management and congregation. In addition, the Headman's policy is considered by the community to be unsupportive. As happened in the implementation of the mapping of the congregation's area in the mosque in one of the sub-villages. The Headman prefers that the congregation of the mosque should be part of the main mosque.

Management is a science and art that regulates the process of utilizing human and other resources effectively and efficiently in achieving certain goals[2]. Management to achieve the goals of the organization or company needs to

determine its achievements with other people [3]. And management is the science and art of achieving goals through the activities of others [4].

Public management can be referred to government management. Public management is a research discipline in organizations. Public management is also a combination of planning, organization, and control with human resource management, finance, information, and politics [5].

Public management does not include administration but involves the organization to achieve goals with full responsibility for getting results. Public sector managerialism is goal-oriented, long-term organizational vision and mission[6].

The creation of customer satisfaction provides benefits, including the relationship between customers and good agencies, providing a good attitude for buyers, creating loyal customers from customers as well as the company's sound recommendations [7]. Customer satisfaction is the customer's response to the difference in initial purchase expectations and product performance when considering using or consuming the product in question.

Based on the notion of community satisfaction, it can be concluded that community satisfaction with the level of community feeling is the level of community feeling to get the desired results in the implementation of development.

Community satisfaction with public organizations is very important because of the relationship of public trust. The better the government and the quality of services provided, the higher the public trust (high trust). Public trust will be higher if the community gets good service and feels satisfied with the service. The General Guidelines for the Implementation of Public Services states that, "The measure of the success service delivery is

determined by the level of satisfaction of service recipients[8].

There are several community satisfaction factors that affect the level of community satisfaction with services or organizations which are seen in 5 levels, namely :

- 1) Service products
- 2) Support service system
- 3) Technical operator
- 4) Customer and service provider interactions
- 5) Emotional part

Community participation means that the community participates, that is, follows and accompanies the government because in fact it is the government which until now is the main designer, organizer, and payer in development. for the people themselves, for the people.

## RESEARCH METHODS

This research used a descriptive qualitative approach [9]. The qualitative data in this research was a general description of the research object, including: a brief history of the establishment, geographical location of the object, vision and mission, organizational structure, village conditions, village officials, facilities and infrastructure conditions, and regulations. The data sources in the research were the subjects from which the data could be obtained [10]. In this research, the researcher used two sources of data, namely primary and secondary data.

The method of collecting data was carried out in several stages that require quite a lot of time and money. Basically, the research failed because of the difficulty of collecting data [11]. Method of collecting data is the most strategic step in research, because the purpose of the research is to obtain data. Without knowing the data collection techniques, the researcher will not get data that is in accordance with the established research

standardization. In qualitative research, data collection methods are known, namely observation, in-depth interviews, and case studies [12].

The list of informants in this research is described in the table below :

**Table 1.** List of Informants

No.	Name	Position
1	Anton Daud	Educators
2	Mulyadi Madina	Public figure
3	Arpan Pane	Youth Leader
4	Fatmawati Tuli	village secretary
5	Yohannes Arminmolango	Head of Government

(Data Source: Bongo Tua Village Data, 2021).

The method of processing and analyzing data in research is essentially a process of processing data that has been obtained in the field so that it becomes information. The final result in the research, besides depending on the data obtained in the field, will also depend on how to analyze the data. Data analysis is the process of systematically searching and compiling data obtained from interviews, field notes, and documentation, by organizing the data into categories, breaking them down into units, synthesizing them, arranging them into patterns, choosing what is important and what is important. to be studied, and draw conclusions so that they are easily understood by themselves and others.

The data processing and analysis method used descriptive analysis technique through qualitative research, which used data and information obtained directly from informants and then analyzed using existing theoretical foundations and describes systematically based on facts in the field. By data reduction, data presentation, draw conclusions.

## RESEARCH RESULT

### 1. Community Satisfaction

#### a. Complaints and Suggestion System,

The customer-centered Bongo Tua Village Government makes it easy for its customers to submit suggestions and complaints, for example through direct agency submissions. Both the BPD and other village institutions. The results of the interview with AA (Educators) on November 20, 2021 said that:

*"So far, I think the village government system in measuring the level of community satisfaction does not exist, at least there is some kind of communication with the community in terms of activities that have been or evaluation of activities and activity plans and I think it can be a measure of community satisfaction in village development."*

The results of interview from MM (Community) on November 23, 2021 said that:

*"So far, as far as I know, there is no way for the village government to measure the level of community satisfaction in development in Bongo Tua village, they just build and build, the village government should directly ask the community whether the development carried out can make the community happy or satisfied or the government come and meet directly with the community to ask questions, at least they know what has been implemented and what are the needs as well as what the current condition of the community is like."*

Even the same opinion was explained by the FT (Village

Secretary) on November 25, 2021 saying that:

*"So far the village government of Bongo Tua does not have a system yet such as a suggestion box so that in measuring the level of community satisfaction in development it has not been able to."*

Even the same opinion explained by AP (young man) on November 16, 2021 said that:

*"For the village government system regarding complaints and suggestions regarding community satisfaction so far, we don't think there should be this the most important thing to do because it involves evaluating the performance of the village government."*

Based on the results of the community opinion that the form or system of suggestions and complaints, which is used by the Bongo Tua Village Government in measuring community satisfaction, was not owned yet, this explains that in providing suggestions and complaints only through the BPD directly, there were also directly to the Bongo Tua Village Government.

**b. Customer satisfaction survey**

The government of Bongo Tua Village is expected to be responsive in measuring community satisfaction directly by conducting periodic surveys. While collecting data on the community. The results of the interview with the Head of the Government Office (YA) November 26, 2021 said that:

*"We feel that the community is satisfied with what we are doing because we have done so much, such as the rebate of the existing*

*concrete in the Ohulingo sub-village, the PAUD healthy house building in 4 sub-villages and all of that we do for the community."*

In addition, the opinion of the FT (Village Secretary) on November 25, 2021 said that:

*"According to the Village Government's view that the community is satisfied with the development carried out in Bongo Tua."*

Even the same opinion was explained by MM (Community) on November 23, 2021 saying that:

*"In our opinion, the development in the village of Bongo Tua is currently being carried out annually, whether they want to or not, being satisfied or dissatisfied, the name of the community is okay, what can you do, that's all that is done."*

Even the same opinion explained by AP (young men community) on November 16, 2021 said that:

*"Until now we are not satisfied with the development because there are still many activities that have not been implemented, such as repairing the road leading to the limu village which has not been repaired until now, there are also some that can be used as a source of community income but there is no government effort. village to fix this, such as using a fish pond in Tomula sub-village."*

Based on the explanation above, it is related to the form of measuring community satisfaction in looking at the results of satisfaction surveys that are carried out regularly, that so far it has been in the form of development, both physical and

non-physical that supports providing community satisfaction. Community expectations are adjusted to the most needed needs in the sub-village in Bongo Tua Village. It should not be close to the public health center PUSTU, the community should be built away from the village center with poor road access conditions.

**c. Abilities and Skills**

The ability and skills of village officials in providing services are very important benchmarks because it is remembered that so far the abilities and skills of village officials have been questioned. Most village officials sometimes take a long time to provide services and even have difficulty in completing services.

The results of the interview with AD (Educator) November 20, 2021 said that:

*"Yes, we think it's normal, nothing special, why do I say that, I say an example for education. This education can be divided into formal and informal education. In formal education, it is very supportive to be able to measure knowledge while non-formal is more about measuring the skills of the apparatus in the village."*

Even supported by the results of an interview with MM (Community) November 23, 2021 said that:

*"The concern of village officials is seen from the extent to which the community provides services quickly so that it makes it easier for the community and the community will be satisfied."*

In addition, the same opinion was explained by the FT (Village

Secretary) November 25, 2021 explained that:

*"The ability of village officials is very questionable because many have taken a long time to provide services, especially if they are pressed."*

Even the same opinion explained by AP (young community) on November 16, 2021 said that:

*"The average ability of the community to receive services from the Bongo Tua Village Government is still questionable because there are still many delays in service. There are even people who wait for hours."*

**d. Public Behavior.**

Behavior in carrying out services is an important benchmark in order to be able to support maximizing ethics in service to the community. Most of the great attention is focused on behavior because the community feels dissatisfied because the need for service without behavior sometimes makes people disappointed in the government of Bongo Tua Village. The results of the interview with YA (Government Section Head) November 26, 2021 said that:

*"For our services, we try our best in providing services to the community, just a small sample when people come to ask for any letters, we directly ask without waiting from the community to convey what letters they need and there is much more that we do relate to services in the village. "*

In addition, the same opinion explained by AP (Youth community) November 25, 2021 said that:

*"The village government serves the community well, sincerely and sincerely so that the community feels satisfied in the service."*

Even this opinion was clarified by MM (Community Leader) 23 November 2021) explaining that:

*"The village government's efforts in service, I think that for village officials this is good, but the Headman who we feel is not good in his service, for example, in a complaint about channel cleaning, there is one community who conveys to the Headman that the Headman can schedule for channel cleaning. this was only answered spontaneously by the Headman, I don't have a rice field, in the case of issuing certificates such as business certificates for loan requirements to the bank it has also been served well by village officials, but at the Headman when the According to him, the person concerned is deemed unfit to be given, it will not be signed even though the debt issue is not the Headman who will pay this, it will be paid by those who are strong and things like this are the community's dissatisfaction with the village government."*

Even the same opinion explained by AP (young community) on November 16, 2021 said that:

*"Most of the behavior shown by the community in development in providing services is considered not to run optimally because there are still many weaknesses in terms of the community's inconsistency in implementing it."*

Based on the explanation above, most people have poor

behavior in supporting the implementation of development because they consider the services provided by the community to be unsatisfactory. It's just that the biggest problem lies with the leadership who is less supportive in carrying out services even for the interests of village development in Bongo Tua Village.

## 2. Community Participation

### a. Physical Participation

Where physical participation explains based on that participation is carried out in the form of organizing an education or business. As in helping the village government of Bongo Tua by building buildings for the community or other forms of assistance. The results of the interview with MM (Community) November 23, 2021 explained that:

*"For now, the physical participation of the community can now be calculated, it is still quite good, we can see from the development carried out, such as the construction of 38 latrines from the Provincial PUPR service, the level of community participation is very active, for example, the Sepiteng excavations are all excavated by their own voluntary use."*

Even another opinion from AD (Educator) November 20, 2021 says that:

*"The current form of community participation is still said to be good, but they are only limited to what they want because there is no kind of good invitation from the government or good communication made by the*

*village government, especially leaders with the community."*

In addition, the same opinion was explained by the FT (Village Secretary) November 25, 2021, explained that:

*"The community always participates in every physical development carried out by the village government."*

Even the same opinion explained by AP (young community) on November 16, 2021 said that:

*"Community participation is currently there if I think it exists, but that's all because it is one of their needs such as cleaning the drains, they do it because it is a major part of their life because most of the Bongo Tuas farmers in the rice fields like it or not they have to clean it but when there are activities involving their village is very minimal to participate even no one wants to work it's only those who are in the scope of the village government such as the sub-village head, the husband of the sub-village head because they don't want to deal directly with the Headman because of the actions of the Headman who often gets angry as if not protecting the community."*

Based on the the research proved that so far the development in Bongo Tua Village has been running well, but community involvement is still considered lacking. Because so far the government of Bongo Tua Village is considered to be lacking in providing direction or receiving community responses in carrying out development, especially physical development in Bongo Tua Village.

#### **b. Non-Physical Participation**

Non-physical participation, talking about community participation in determining direction, national education and the even distribution of public interest in researching through education, so that the Bongo Tua village government will have no difficulty in directing the community to participate. However, there are several problems that arise because of weaknesses or problems caused by the people of Bongo Tua Village to feel that the village government lacks participation with the community to discuss more about the program.

The results of the interview with the FT (Village Secretary) on November 25, 2021 explained that:

*"Most of the people give good ideas or ideas for the continuity or smooth development of the village."*

In addition, the same opinion was explained by MM (Community) on November 13, 2021 saying that:

*"Right now, talking about non-physical community participation is getting lost, it can be seen from the invitation when at the time of the development planning deliberation in the village, the community at this time refuses to attend. because they are afraid that they are the recipients of incentives, only a few people are present - that's all that is present, it can even be said to be very minimal from the number of invitations and this also results in a lack of community participation in contributing*



*ideas for the implementation of development."*

Even the opinion explained by AD (Tokoh Educator) on November 20, 2021 said that:

*"As for non-physical community participation, as far as I know, it's minimal, why is it because of the character of the Headman who doesn't want to accept other people's suggestions, is arrogant and gets angry easily when there are suggestions from the community that don't match their wishes. participate in development planning."*

Even the same opinion explained by AP (young community) on November 16, 2021 said that:

*"Regarding non-physical participation, I am also very concerned, I only remember that village development planning must involve the community, but the community is currently reluctant to attend the implementation of such activities. which was carried out in the village when the front seat had not been filled, he immediately became angry, it should have been conveyed properly, even like yesterday's problem in the pikolo sub-village, namely the mapping of the main mosque congregation area with the mosque in the sub-village, even when meeting with the community at a young reception, he often said that I was a former thug, so some people think why the Headman seems to want to have a relationship with this community, this is what makes the community reluctant to participate."*

Based on the results of interviews with several community leaders, it was explained that the implementation of non-physical development so far has not been able to be carried out properly, seeing from the Bongo Tua village government itself that it has not been fully able to support community participation in implementing development. In fact, many people are not allowed to give advice on the implementation of development in Bongo Tua Village.

## DISCUSSION

### 1. Community Satisfaction in Development at Bongo Tua Village

Based on the results of research where the form or system of suggestions and complaints, which is used by the Bongo Tua Village Government in measuring community satisfaction, it is not owned yet, this explains that in providing suggestions and complaints only through the BPD, there are also directly to the Bongo Tua Village Government. The form of measuring community satisfaction is in looking at the results of satisfaction surveys that are carried out regularly, that so far it has been in the form of development, both physical and non-physical that supports providing community satisfaction. Community expectations are adjusted to the most needed needs in the Dusun in Bongo Tua Village. The role of the Bongo Tua Village Government in seeing the condition of the community in carrying out services in Bongo Tua Village is considered not so maximal because there are still many community needs that are needed.

The government should be more consistent in service, because this is a

measure of community satisfaction. The form of measuring community satisfaction is in looking at the results of satisfaction surveys that are carried out regularly that so far in the form of physical and non-physical development that supports providing community satisfaction. Community expectations are adjusted to the most needed needs in the Dusun in Bongo Tua Village. For example, the posyandu building is expected to be built in one of the sub-villages far from the village center where the road access is damaged, not close to the Pustu which is in the center of the village. Even the steps taken by the Bongo Tua Village Government in providing satisfaction to the community, especially in service, depend on the community. The government should be more consistent in service, it's just that there is no seriousness of the Government in implementing services to the community in Bongo Tua Village. The role of the Bongo Tua Village Government in looking at the skills and abilities of the community is apparently still considered less than optimal because there is no village government effort to develop village potential and empower village communities. As farmers are currently experiencing a shortage of fertilizers, the village government should provide training to farmers for the manufacture of organic fertilizers. Likewise with the cake craftsmen, this should also be a special concern for the Bongo Tua Village government

In addition, most people have poor behavior in supporting the implementation of development because they consider the services provided by the village government to be unsatisfactory. It's just that the biggest problem lies with the

leadership who is not supportive in carrying out services even for the interests of village development in Bongo Tua Village. This is recognized by some people who are considered less trusting until now, so the behavior seen by many people who are not satisfied is shown by the existing behavior.

The results of the research are described in four methods that can be used to measure customer satisfaction, namely the complaint or suggestion system method, customer satisfaction survey, ghost shopping method, and lost customer analysis [13]. Customer Satisfaction Index analysis is one way of knowing the level of customer satisfaction using the customer satisfaction survey method. From the calculation results, it is obtained that the community satisfaction index (IKM) is 3.03, which means that the level of community satisfaction is included in the "good category. From this basis it is known that so far the role of the Bongo Tua Village Government in seeing the condition of the community in carrying out services has been very supportive in development and has provided community satisfaction. However, those who do not support the form or system of suggestions and complaints, which are used by the Bongo Tua Village Government in measuring community satisfaction are not yet fully supported in providing community satisfaction.

## **2. Community Participation in Development in Bongo Tua Village**

In terms of community participation in the implementation of development, both physically and non-physically, it has not been going well. This is based on the fact that the development in Bongo Tua Village has been going well, but community

involvement is still considered lacking. Because so far, the Bongo Tua Village Government is considered to be lacking in providing direction or receiving community responses in carrying out development, especially physical development in Bongo Tua Village. Even some community leaders explained that the implementation of non-physical development so far has not been able to be carried out properly, seeing from the Bongo Tua village government itself that it has not been fully able to support community participation in implementing development. In fact, many people are not allowed to give advice on the implementation of development in Bongo Tua Village.

Regarding non-physical participation, this is also very concerning, considering that village development planning must involve the community, but currently there are still many people who are not present in carrying out such activities because the actions of the Headman are considered rude in giving mandates to the community. So sometimes it makes people feel disappointed with the services provided by the government of Bongo Tua Village. Physical participation. Where this participation is participation carried out in the form of organizing an education or business. Such as school businesses, making scholarships, and also helping the government by building buildings for the community or other forms of assistance [14].

Even non-physical participation, especially in participation that involves the community in determining its goals. Such as where to take national education and also the distribution of insight and the desire of the community to research by means of education. So that the government

has no difficulty in giving directions to the community to go to school. Even the results of the research show that leadership has a positive effect on community participation, community participation has a positive effect on the success rate of the project, and leadership has a positive effect on the success rate of the Rural PNPM Mandiri project in Gerokgak District [15]. From this it is known that community participation in terms of physical participation is more dominant than non-physical participation in the implementation of development in Bongo Tua Village.

## CONCLUSION

Based on the results research and discussion above, it is known that so far in the implementation of development by looking at the satisfaction and participation of the community, it is considered not optimal.

1. Based on the results of research for community satisfaction, it is considered that there was no form or system for suggestions and complaints, which is used by the Bongo Tua Village Government because it only directly provides suggestions and complaints only through the BPD directly, there was also directly to the Bongo Tua Village Government. The form of measuring community satisfaction was by looking at the results of satisfaction surveys that were conducted periodically that so far it has been in the form of development, both physical and non-physical that supports providing the community satisfaction.
2. Even for skills and abilities in implementing development, it was still considered lacking and

- there were still many people who were not satisfied. For public behavior in assessing the services provided to the community, it was considered not good because there were still individual attitudes in the Village Government that were not concerned with the community.
3. In terms of community participation, especially the implementation of development in Bongo Tua Village, it was considered not optimal considering that it turned out that so far participation in physical matters has been running, but participation in non-physical matters was less supportive in the implementation of development in Bongo Tua Village.

#### BIBLIOGRAPHY

- [1] Nurman. 2015. *Strategi Pembangunan Daerah.*, Cetakan ke-1. Jakarta: PT. Raja Grafindo Persada.
- [2] Hasibuan, Malayu S. P. 2010. *Manajemen Sumber Daya Manusia.* Jakarta. PT. Bumi Aksara.
- [3] Nawawi, 2011. *Manajemen Sumber Daya Manusia: Untuk Bisnis Yang Kompetitif*, Yogyakarta: Gajahmada University Press.
- [4] Nitisemito, Alex S. 2012. *Manajemen Suatu Dasar dan Pengantar* Jakarta: Arena. Ilmu
- [5] Sudarmanto, Ekodkk. 2020. *Manajemen Sektor Publik.* Yayasan Kita Menulis.
- [6] Mahmudi. 2010. *Manajemen Kinerja Sektor Publik*, Edisi Kedua, Yogyakarta: UPP. STIM. YKPN
- [7] Pasolong, Harbani. 2010. *Teori Administrasi iPublik*, Bandung: Alfabeta
- [8] KEPMENPAN Nomor 63 tahun 2003 tentang *Pedoman Umum Penyelenggaraan Pelayanan Publik*
- [9] Sugiyono. 2016. *Metode Penelitian Kuantitatif, Kualitatif dan R&D.* Bandung: PT Alfabet
- [10] Arikunto, S. 2013. *Prosedur Penelitian: Suatu Pendekatan Praktik.* Jakarta: Rineka Cipta
- [11] Suliyanto. 2018. *Metode Penelitian Bisnis untuk Skripsi, Tesis, & Disertasi*
- [12] Kriyantono, Rachmat. 2014. *Teknik Praktis Riset Komunikasi.* Jakarta: Prenada media Group
- [13] Tjiptono, Fandy. 2014, *Pemasaran Jasa – Prinsip, Penerapan, dan Penelitian*, Yogyakarta: Andi. Offset
- [14] Dwiningrum, S.I.A. 2015. *Desentralisasi dan. Partisipasi Masyarakat dalam Pendidikan.* Yogyakarta: Pustaka Pelajar
- [15] Putu Riska Wulandari, I K G Bendasadan Ida Ayu Nyoman Saskara. 2014. Analisis Partisipasi Masyarakat dan Kepemimpinan terhadap Tingkat Keberhasilan Proyek Program Nasional Pemberdayaan Masyarakat (PNPM) Mandiri Perdesaan di Kecamatan Gerokgak, Buleleng-Bali. *Jurnal Buletin Studi Ekonomi*, Vol. 19, No. 2, Agustus 2014.